

Steven M. Wilker, OSB No. 911882  
Email: steven.wilker@tonkon.com  
Tonkon Torp LLP  
1600 Pioneer Tower  
888 SW 5th Avenue  
Portland, OR 97204  
Tel.: (503) 802-2040; Fax: (503) 972-3740  
Cooperating Attorney for the ACLU Foundation of Oregon

Hina Shamsi (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: hshamsi@aclu.org  
Hugh Handeyside (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: hhandeyside@aclu.org  
American Civil Liberties Union Foundation  
125 Broad Street, 18th Floor  
New York, NY 10004  
Tel.: (212) 549-2500; Fax: (212) 549-2654

Ahilan T. Arulanantham (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: aarulanantham@aclu-sc.org  
Jennifer Pasquarella (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: jpasquarella@aclu-sc.org  
ACLU Foundation of Southern California  
1313 West Eighth Street  
Los Angeles, CA 90017  
Tel.: (213) 977-9500; Fax: (213) 977-5297

Alan L. Schlosser (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: aschlosser@aclunc.org  
Julia Harumi Mass (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: jmass@aclunc.org  
ACLU Foundation of Northern California  
39 Drumm Street  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Tel.: (415) 621-2493; Fax: (415) 255-8437

Alexandra F. Smith (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: asmith@aclu-nm.org  
ACLU Foundation of New Mexico  
P.O. Box 566  
Albuquerque, NM 87103  
Tel.: (505) 266-5915; Fax: (505) 266-5916

Mitchell P. Hurley (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: mhurley@akingump.com  
Christopher M. Egleson (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: cegleson@akingump.com  
Justin H. Bell (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: bellj@akingump.com  
Akin Gump Strauss Hauer & Feld LLP  
One Bryant Park  
New York, NY 10036  
Tel.: (212) 872-1011; Fax: (212) 872-1002

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs Salah Ali Ahmed, Nagib Ali Ghaleb, Mohamed Sheikh Abdirahman Kariye, Faisal Meshal, Raymond Earl Knaeble, Ayman Latif, Ibraheim Mashal, Amir Mohamed Meshal, Elias Mustafa Mohamed, Abdullatif Muthanna, Steven Meshal, and Mashaal Rana*

William Genego (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
E-mail: bill@genegolaw.com  
Law Office of William Genego  
2115 Main Street  
Santa Monica, California 90405  
Tel: (310) 399-3259

Justine Fischer, OSB No. 812241  
Email: jfattyor@aol.com  
710 SW Madison St., Suite 400  
Portland, OR 97205  
Tel: (503) 222-4326; Fax: (503) 222-6567

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Stephen Persaud*

BENJAMIN C. MIZER  
Acting Assistant Attorney General  
Civil Division

DIANE KELLEHER  
Assistant Branch Director  
Federal Programs Branch

AMY POWELL  
amy.powell@usdoj.gov  
BRIGHAM J. BOWEN  
brigham.bowen@usdoj.gov  
ADAM KIRSCHNER  
adam.kirschner@usdoj.gov  
U.S. Department of Justice  
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch  
20 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Tel: (202) 514-6289  
Fax: (202) 616-8470

*Attorneys for Defendants*

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
**DISTRICT OF OREGON**

AYMAN LATIF, et al.,  <i>Plaintiffs,</i>	Case 3:10-cv-00750-BR
v.  ERIC H. HOLDER, JR., et al.,  <i>Defendants.</i>	<b>JOINT STATEMENT OF AGREED FACTS RELEVANT TO PLAINTIFF AMIR MESHAL</b>

In accordance with the Court’s Case Management Order dated February 13, 2015 (Dkt. No. 168), the parties have conferred and hereby submit the following Joint Statement of Agreed Facts Relevant to Plaintiff Amir Meshal:

1. In 2014, after the issuance of this Court’s June 2014 Memorandum Opinion and Order (Dkt. No. 136), the Government advised the Court that it was undertaking a revision of its existing redress process. In connection with that effort in this case, and in accordance with the Court’s October 3, 2015 Case Management Order (Dkt. No. 152), Defendants conducted a substantive reconsideration of Mr. Meshal’s DHS TRIP complaint.
2. On November 24, 2014, Defendants provided Mr. Meshal with a DHS TRIP notification letter, a redacted version of which is attached hereto as Exhibit A, and which is being submitted in unredacted form pursuant to a proposed protective order and a motion to seal.
3. The DHS TRIP notification letter informed Mr. Meshal that he is on the No Fly List because he had been “‘identified as an individual who ‘may be a threat to civil aviation or national security.’ 49 U.S.C. § 114(h)(3)(A).”
4. The DHS TRIP notification letter to Mr. Meshal further stated that “it has been determined that you are an individual who represents a threat of engaging in or conducting a violent act of terrorism and who is operationally capable of doing so.”
5. The DHS TRIP notification letter to Mr. Meshal also provided “an unclassified summary that includes reasons supporting” his placement on the No Fly List.
6. The DHS TRIP notification letter to Mr. Meshal did not disclose all of the reasons or information that the Government relied upon in determining that he should remain on the No Fly List.
7. The DHS TRIP notification letter informed Mr. Meshal that the Government was “unable to provide additional disclosures” regarding his placement on the No Fly List.

8. The DHS TRIP notification letter to Mr. Meshal did not discuss the presence or absence of information not reflected in the letter that might be in the Government's possession contravening Mr. Meshal's placement on the No Fly List.
9. The DHS TRIP notification letter did not provide Mr. Meshal with his full prior statements on which the Government relied in determining that he should remain on the No Fly List.
10. The DHS TRIP notification letter did not confirm or deny whether any particular surveillance techniques were used to procure information that formed a basis for including Mr. Meshal on the No Fly List.
11. The DHS TRIP notification letter invited Mr. Meshal to respond by written submission on or before December 15, 2014.
12. By letter dated December 5, 2014, counsel for Mr. Meshal wrote to counsel for the Defendants seeking additional information and procedures. (Dkt. No. 167-1.)
13. By letter dated December 14, 2014, counsel for Defendants advised counsel for Mr. Meshal that they believed the notification letters and revised redress program were appropriate. (Dkt. No. 167-2.)
14. On December 18, 2014, Mr. Meshal submitted a response to the DHS TRIP notification letter. A redacted version of the response is attached hereto as Exhibit B, which is being submitted in unredacted form pursuant to a proposed protective order and a motion to seal.
15. The Government assessed Mr. Meshal's response, and on January 21, 2015 the Acting Administrator of the TSA issued a final determination, which is attached hereto as Exhibit C.
16. The Government's reconsideration of Mr. Meshal's DHS TRIP complaint did not include a hearing at which live testimony could be presented or witnesses cross-examined.
17. The TSA Administrator's final determination concluded that Mr. Meshal should remain on the No Fly List.

Dated: March 13, 2015

Steven M. Wilker, OSB No. 911882  
Email: steven.wilker@tonkon.com  
Tonkon Torp LLP  
1600 Pioneer Tower  
888 SW 5th Avenue  
Portland, OR 97204  
Tel.: (503) 802-2040; Fax: (503) 972-3740  
Cooperating Attorney for the ACLU  
Foundation of Oregon

BENJAMIN C. MIZER  
Acting Assistant Attorney General

DIANE KELLEHER  
Assistant Branch Director  
Federal Programs Branch

s/ Hina Shamsi

Hina Shamsi (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: hshamsi@aclu.org  
Hugh Handeyside (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: hhandeyside@aclu.org  
American Civil Liberties Union Foundation  
125 Broad Street, 18th Floor  
New York, NY 10004  
Tel.: (212) 549-2500; Fax: (212) 549-2654

Ahilan T. Arulanantham (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: aarulanantham@aclu-sc.org  
Jennifer Pasquarella (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: jpasquarella@aclu-sc.org  
ACLU Foundation of Southern California  
1313 West Eighth Street  
Los Angeles, CA 90017  
Tel.: (213) 977-9500; Fax: (213) 977-5297

Alan L. Schlosser (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: aschlosser@aclunc.org  
Julia Harumi Mass (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: jmass@aclunc.org  
ACLU Foundation of Northern California  
39 Drumm Street  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Tel.: (415) 621-2493; Fax: (415) 255-8437

Alexandra F. Smith (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: asmith@aclu-nm.org  
ACLU Foundation of New Mexico  
P.O. Box 566  
Albuquerque, NM 87103  
Tel.: (505) 266-5915; Fax: (505) 266-5916

Mitchell P. Hurley (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: mhurley@akingump.com  
Christopher M. Egleson (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: cegleson@akingump.com  
Justin H. Bell (Admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Email: bellj@akingump.com  
Akin Gump Strauss Hauer & Feld LLP  
One Bryant Park  
New York, NY 10036  
Tel.: (212) 872-1011; Fax: (212) 872-1002

s/ Brigham Bowen

AMY POWELL  
amy.powell@usdoj.gov  
BRIGHAM J. BOWEN  
brigham.bowen@usdoj.gov  
SAM SINGER  
samuel.m.singer@usdoj.gov  
ADAM KIRSCHNER  
adam.kirschner@usdoj.gov  
U.S. Department of Justice  
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch  
20 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Tel: (202) 514-6289  
Fax: (202) 616-8470

***Attorneys for Defendants***

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs Salah Ali Ahmed, Nagib Ali Ghaleb, Mohamed Sheikh Abdirahman Kariye, Faisal Meshal, Raymond Earl Knaeble, Ayman Latif, Ibraheim Mashal, Amir Mohamed Meshal, Elias Mustafa Mohamed, Abdullatif Muthanna, Steven Meshal, and Mashaal Rana*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that a copy of the foregoing stipulation was delivered to all counsel of record via the Court's ECF notification system.

*s/ Hina Shamsi*