

**EXHIBIT F**  
**FILED UNDER SEAL**

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON  
AT SEATTLE

```

-----X
ABDIQAFAR WAGAFE, et al., on      )
behalf of themselves and others  )
similarly situated,              )
                                  )
                                Plaintiffs, ) No.
                                  )
v.                                ) 17-cv-00094 RAJ
                                  )
DONALD TRUMP, President of the   )
United States, et al.,          )
                                  )
                                Defendants. )
-----X

```

CONFIDENTIAL UNDER THE PROTECTIVE ORDER  
VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF KEVIN MARK SHINABERRY  
Monday, August 31, 2020; 10:24 a.m. EST

Job No.: 623007

Pgs. 1 - 221

Reported by: Cindy L. Sebo, RMR, CRR, RPR, CSR, CCR,  
CLR, RSA, Remote Counsel Reporter, LiveDeposition  
Authorized Reporter

MAGNA LEGAL SERVICES  
(866) 624-6221  
www.MagnaLS.com

1                                    Confidential Videotaped Deposition  
2    of KEVIN MARK SHINABERRY taken by Counsel for  
3    Plaintiffs, held remotely before Cindy L. Sebo,  
4    Registered Merit Court Reporter, Certified Real-Time  
5    Reporter, Registered Professional Reporter, Certified  
6    Shorthand Reporter, Certified Court Reporter,  
7    Certified LiveNote Reporter, Real-Time Systems  
8    Administrator, Remote Counsel Reporter,  
9    LiveDeposition Authorized Reporter and Notary Public,  
10   beginning at approximately 10:24 a.m. EST, when were  
11   present on behalf of the respective parties:

12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22

1 A P P E A R A N C E S:

2 (All via Zoom Video Communications)

3 Attorney for Plaintiffs:

4 HARVARD IMMIGRATION AND REFUGEE CLINICAL

5 PROGRAM, HARVARD LAW SCHOOL

6 SAMEER AHMED, ESQUIRE

7 6 Everett Street

8 Cambridge, Massachusetts 02138

9 617.384.0088

10 sahed@law.harvard.edu

11 -and-

12 ACLU FOUNDATION OF SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA

13 JENNIFER PASQUARELLA, ESQUIRE

14 1313 W. 8th Street

15 Los Angeles, California 90017

16 213.977.5236

17 jpasquarella@aclusocal.org

18 (Continued)

19

20

21

22

1           A P P E A R A N C E S (Continued):

2           Attorney for Plaintiffs (Continued):

3           PERKINS COIE LLP

4           PAIGE L. WHIDBEE, ESQUIRE

5           1201 Third Avenue, Suite 4900

6           Seattle, Washington 98101-3099

7           206.359.3629

8           HSchneider@perkinscoie.com

9

10

11          Attorneys for Defendants:

12          U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE, CIVIL DIVISION

13          LEON B. TARANTO, ESQUIRE

14          1331 Pennsylvania Avenue, Northwest

15          Room 8018-S

16          Washington, D.C. 20004

17          202.616.4231

18          leon.b.taranto@usdoj.gov

19

(Continued)

20

21

22

1                   A P P E A R A N C E S (Continued):

2           Attorney for Defendants (Continued):

3                   ANDREW BRINKMAN, ESQUIRE

4                   P.O. Box 878, Ben Franklin Station

5                   Washington, D.C. 20044

6                   202.305.7035

7                   andrew.brinkman@usdoj.gov

8   -and-

9                   U.S. CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES

10                  U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY

11                  CAITLIN MILLER, ESQUIRE

12                  JESSICA SCHAU NELSON, ESQUIRE

13                  KAITLYN CHARETTE, ESQUIRE

14                  11 Massachusetts Avenue, Northwest

15                  Suite 3100, Mail Stop 2121

16                  Washington, D.C. 20529-2121

17                  202.272.1107

18                  caitlin.e.miller@uscis.dhs.gov

19

20

21

22

1                   A P P E A R A N C E S (Continued):

2           Attorney for Defendants (Continued):

3                   U.S. ATTORNEYS OFFICE (SEA)

4                   BRIAN C. KIPNIS, ESQUIRE

5                   700 Stewart Street, Suite 5220

6                   Seattle, Washington 98101-1271

7                   206.553.7970

8                   brian.kipnis@usdoj.gov

9

10

11           ALSO PRESENT:

12                   DAN KATZ, Videographer

13                   SEAN KRUSKOL, Cornerstone Research

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

1 INDEX OF EXAMINATION

2

3 KEVIN MARK SHINABERRY

4 EXAMINATION BY PAGE

5 Mr. Ahmed 12, 92

6

7 - - -

8 INDEX TO EXHIBITS

9 - - -

10 (Exhibits Attached to the Original Transcript.)

11 DEPOSITION EXHIBIT DESCRIPTION PAGE

12 Exhibit A Agreement for Taking of  
13 Deposition of USCIS Pursuant  
14 to Rule 30(b)(6), F.R.Civ.P. 17

15  
16 Exhibit B Excel Spreadsheet 24

17 Exhibit C CSV file 26

18  
19 Exhibit C1 Excerpt from the USCIS  
20 detail data 94

21

22



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22

- - -

INDEX TO EXHIBITS (Continued)

- - -

| DEPOSITION<br>EXHIBIT | DESCRIPTION  | PAGE |
|-----------------------|--|------|
| Exhibit C2            | Excerpt from the USCIS<br>detail data  | 173  |
| Exhibit C3            | Excerpt from the USCIS<br>detail data  | 176  |
| Exhibit C4            | Excerpt from the USCIS<br>detail data  | 198  |
| Exhibit C5            | Excerpt from the USCIS<br>detail data  | 202  |
| Exhibit C6            | Excerpt from the USCIS<br>detail data  | 204  |
| Exhibit D             | FY2014 INSITE Review Results,<br>CARRP assessment, Bates<br>stamped DEF-00147440 through<br>DEF-00147444 | 71   |

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22

- - -

INDEX TO EXHIBITS (Continued)

- - -

| DEPOSITION<br>EXHIBIT | DESCRIPTION  | PAGE |
|-----------------------|--|------|
| Exhibit E             | Data dictionary  | 82   |
| Exhibit F             | E-mail string  | 106  |
| Exhibit G             | CARRP Overview Lecture, Bates<br>stamped DEF-00429503 through<br>DEF-00429574                                | 116  |
| Exhibit H             | USCIS User Guide, FDNS-DS<br>User Guide, Release 16.2,<br>Bates stamped DEF-00428622<br>through DEF-00429219 | 118  |
| Exhibit I             | Excel Spreadsheet  | 160  |

1 S T I P U L A T I O N S

2

3 IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED

4 by and between counsel no party to the litigation  
5 will object to the remote deposition on the grounds  
6 that the certified stenographer may not have the  
7 legal authority to swear in the witness.

8

9 FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED

10 that in lieu of the oath administered in person,  
11 the witness declares the testimony in this matter  
12 under the penalty of perjury.

13

14 FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED

15 that the certified stenographer is not physically  
16 present in the deposition room and will be  
17 reporting this deposition remotely.

18

19 FURTHER STIPULATED AND AGREED

20 all parties and their counsel consent to this  
21 arrangement and waive any objections to this manner  
22 of reporting.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22

P R O C E E D I N G S

Remote Deposition

Monday, August 31, 2020; 10:24 a.m.

THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are now on  
the record.

This begins the -- Video 1 in the  
deposition of Kevin Shinaberry in the  
matter of Abdiqafar Wagafe, et al. versus  
Donald Trump, President of the United  
States, et al., in the  
United States District Court,  
Western District of Washington at  
Seattle.

Today is Monday, August 31st,  
2020. The time is 10:24 a.m. Eastern.

Deposition is being taken remotely  
at the request of Perkins Coie LLP.

The videographer is Dan Katz, and  
the court reporter is Cindy Sebo.

All counsel and parties present

1 will be noted on the stenographic record.

2 Will the court reporter please

3 swear in the witness?

4 - - -

5 KEVIN MARK SHINABERRY,

6 after having been first duly sworn remotely

7 by the certified stenographer, was examined

8 and testified remotely as follows:

9 - - -

10 CERTIFIED STENOGRAPHER: The

11 witness is sworn, and I'll go on mute.

12 - - -

13 EXAMINATION BY COUNSEL FOR PLAINTIFFS

14 - - -

15 BY MR. AHMED:

16 Q. Hi, Mr. Shinaberry.

17 Could you please state your name for

18 the record?

19 A. Kevin Mark Shinaberry.

20 Q. My name is Sameer Ahmed, and I'm one

21 of the attorneys for the Plaintiffs in this case.

22 How are you doing this morning?

1 (Certified Stenographer requested  
2 clarification due to audio  
3 distortion/malfunction.)

4 BY MR. AHMED:

5 Q. So in this excerpt from the USCIS  
6 detail data, it lists a receipt date of  
7 August 29th, 2019 and the current status date of  
8 August 29th, 2019. And it says the application  
9 has been approved.

10 And how can an application be  
11 approved the same day it was received?

12 A. Yeah. And so I think the crux of the  
13 issue is a -- a data entry error, likely at the  
14 time of -- of adjudication.

15 Q. Do you know approximately how many  
16 entries have data errors at the time of  
17 adjudication?

18 MR. TARANTO: Counsel, are you  
19 asking as to the -- each of the nine-plus  
20 million cases that are adjudicated?

21 MR. AHMED: I'm asking of the  
22 USCIS detail data that had 10 million

1 entries. So does he have an idea of  
2 approximately how many of those entries  
3 would have data errors.

4 THE WITNESS: Obvious ones like --  
5 like this with zero or negative  
6 processing times is a very small number.  
7 Out of all 10.6 million applications, I  
8 believe it's probably a few hundred.

9 BY MR. AHMED:

10 Q. But you don't know that for sure,  
11 correct? You're just estimating?

12 A. I could determine it by looking at  
13 the data, but off the top of my head, I do not  
14 know that for certain.

15 Q. Let's turn back to a -- USCIS summary  
16 data, which is previously marked Exhibit E.

17 And do you see this in front of you,  
18 data that was provided to Plaintiffs in June of  
19 2020?

20 A. I do.

21 Q. So I want to turn to the third tab,  
22 Adjudicated processing times.

1 Do you see the tables on this tab?

2 A. Yes, I do.

3 Q. And these tables say -- or this tab  
4 contains tables for the average and median  
5 processing times for adjudicated applications; is  
6 that correct?

7 A. That's correct.

8 Q. And if you look at Note 3 here, it  
9 says, Processing times for adjudicated  
10 applications are calculated using latest  
11 adjudicated decision minus the receipt date.

12 Is that correct?

13 A. That's correct.

14 Q. So for the entries where the current  
15 status date is prior to the receipt date, how  
16 were those processing times calculated?

17 A. What I did and is the normal practice  
18 in our reporting on processing times is to  
19 exclude values less than -- than 1. So those  
20 applications are included in receipt counts but  
21 excluded from the processing times.

22 Q. Is that noted anywhere on this



1 document?

2 A. I don't believe so.

3 Q. So to your understanding, you had  
4 excluded -- scratch that.

5 I guess the -- similar to -- for the  
6 entries where the current status date is equal  
7 to receipt date, were those processing times  
8 also excluded on this table?

9 A. Yes, and any processing time less  
10 than 1. So if they have an equal date, they're  
11 going to be excluded.

12 Q. But say someone -- but -- say the --  
13 the current status date was improperly inserted  
14 two days after the receipt date.

15 That wouldn't be included in this  
16 table, correct?

17 A. If the status date was two days after  
18 the receipt date, it would be included.

19 Q. So say USCIS made an error and they  
20 said the application is adjudicated and approved  
21 two days after it was received.

22 That application would be included

1 in the processing times reflected in this data,  
2 correct?

3 MR. TARANTO: Objection: lack of  
4 foundation.

5 But you may answer, if you can.

6 THE WITNESS: Theoretically, yes,  
7 that would be included.

8 MR. AHMED: Okay. If we could go  
9 off the record, I -- for about  
10 10 minutes. I just want to see what  
11 other questions I may have for you. And  
12 then hopefully we can wrap up this  
13 deposition. So let's go off the record.

14 Sorry.

15 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: I couldn't  
16 unmute there.

17 4:09 p.m. We're off the record.

18 - - -

19 (Whereupon, a recess was taken from  
20 4:09 p.m. to 4:23 p.m.)

21 - - -

22 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: 4:23 p.m.